Cadilla—an Indian company — 400Kgs. Should I say it loudly.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Say it loudly.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: We have allowed Lupin 400 Kgs.—three times more than this multinational. We have allowed Tamil Nadu Dada 110 Kgs. Now if they do not start producing and if. . . (*Interruptions*). It is really funny, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, you should see me and speak. You are seeing them directly; that is why you get into trouble.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: I see them and speak through you. Now, the only way to fulfil the requirement of the people for this useful drug is to produce more and produce it through our own national companies. We have allowed them full facility; they could do it from the basic stage. They can do it even from the penultimate stage. Now, what is the other way that we can protect the interests of the people if all the time we are going to take satisfaction in a sort of, attacking like Don Quixote against the wind mill? This will not serve the purpose.

SHRIMATI MAIMOONA SULTAN: Sir, it is quite refreshing to hear the hon. Minister after such a long time. After all, he has been a member of the Hathi Committee also. There is a touch of poetic eloquence in his answer. Therefore, that could not be strictly to the mark. In any case, may I know whether it is correct that the international price of the bulk drug, dexamethasone 21 Phosphate is around Rs. 32,000 per kg? This has been stated in reply to Starred? Question No. 112. Now, may I also know that the company got the price fixed by the Government for the formulation at Rs. 93,000 per kg.? Now, in view of the fact that this company is importing, from the penultimate or intermediate stage, whatever it is, this drug at Rs. 27,000 per kg. only, just to save Rs. 5,000, you are permitting the manufacturer a huge margin of nearly Rs. 63,000 per kg. Why it is so? This has been going on for the last fifteen-twenty years. Now, the hon. Minister must be in a position to answer this question. If he can answer the question, many burdens would be lifted.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, the fact is, as far as this price matter is concerned, it is *sub judice*. We really do not have control.

DR. JOSEPH LEON D' SOUZA: Prior to it becoming *sub judice*, what were you doing?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: We had fixed at 51.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do not answer interruptions please. Answer only the main question.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Interruptions also will go on record.

MR CHAIRMAN: This will mislead you.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: This will go on record. That is why, I must counter that. Otherwise, it will be misleading. May I say that even Cadilla is charging Rs. 2.79 for ten tablets of Dekadron, which is Cadilla's whereas the price of Dexona tablet of M/s Merind is Rs. 2.47 for ten tablets. Why are they charging higher if they are also getting the imported material basic drug, Dexamethasone, at the price fixed, as was contended? Therefore, we have no control on the price.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Indian commany is charging higher.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, Indian company is charging higher.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question.

**भोपाल में यूनियन कार्बाइड कारखाना**

*283 **श्री प्यारेलाल खंडेलवाल** : क्या उद्योग मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या यह सच है कि भोपाल में यूनियन कार्बाइड में खतरनाक रसा-

यनों के शोध का कार्य अभी भी चालू है ;

(ख) क्या यह भी सच है कि उक्त शोधित रसायन गृह युद्ध कार्य के लिये उपयोग में लाये जाते हैं, यदि हां, तो क्या यह भी सच है कि सरकार ने केवल यनियन कार्बाइड को आयकर से छूट देने की अनुमति का नवीनीकरण करने से इंकार किया है, परन्तु यूनियन कार्बाइड के भोपाल स्थित शोध केन्द्र की गतिविधियां और उसका शोध कार्य पूर्ववत चालू है; और

(ग) क्या यह भी सच है कि भोपाल स्थित यूनियन कार्बाइड के कारखाने में कुछ जहरीले और खतरनाक रसायन अभी भी मौजूद हैं?

**रसायन और पैट्रो-रसायन विभाग में राज्य मंत्री (श्री आर० के० जयचन्द्र सिंह)**: (क) जी, नहीं।

(ख) प्रश्न नहीं उठता।

(ग) कम्पनी ने तीन अत्यधिक खतरनाक रसायनों अर्थात् क्लोरीन, क्लोरोसल्फोनिक एसिड और मोनोमिथाइल अमाइन की सम्पूर्ण मात्रा का निपटान कर दिया है। कम्पनी अन्य मदों के निपटान के लिये प्रयास कर रही है।

**श्री प्यारेलाल खंडेलवाल**: सभापति जी, साल भर पूर्व भोपाल में जो गैस दुर्घटना हुई थी वह दुनिया में सबसे अधिक भयानक मानव निर्मित औद्योगिक दुर्घटना थी और अभी तक इस बात का पता लगाया जाना बाकी है कि जो भोपाल में यूनियन कारबाइड से गैस रिसी और वह कौन सी गैस थी? यह युद्ध मे प्रतिबन्धित बैन्जीन मिश्रण गैस थी या मोथाइलआइसो साइनेट गैस थी, इसका पता अभी भी वैज्ञानिक लगा रहे है और इस बात को प्रबन्धक और सरकार छिपाने की कोशिश कर रही है। श्रीमान्, सरकार ने मेरे प्रश्न (क) और (ख) के बारे में नकारात्मक उत्तर दिया है। सरकार की यह आदत रही है कि वह ऐसे प्रश्न का उतर नकारात्मक रूप में देती रही है। मैं आपको याद दिलाना चाहता हूं कि 1983-84 में अर्जुन सिंह सरकार ने मध्यप्रदेश विधान सभा में इस यूनियन कारबाइड कारखाने की सुरक्षा प्रबन्ध के बारे में यह कहा था कि वहां पर पूरी तरह से सुरक्षा के प्रबन्ध है और वहां पर कोई दुर्घटना नहीं होगी। लेकिन इसके बावजूद भोपाल मे यूनियन कारबाइड में दुर्घटना हुई और यह दुर्घटना दुनिया के इतिहास में एक काला पृष्ठ बनी है। सभापति महोदय, मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि सरकार ने प्रश्न (क) और (ख) का जो उत्तर दिया है यह सदन को गुमराह करने वाला है, जनता को गुमराह करने वाला है। भोपाल के नागरिक इस बात से चिन्तित हैं कि भोपाल के शिमला हिल्स पर यूनियन कारबाइड का अनुसंधान केन्द्र अभी तक काम करर हा है। सरकार ने इस बात को स्वीकार किया है कि अभी कुछ मुद्दे यूनियन कारबाइड ने निपटाने है और कुछ को निपटा दिया गया है। मेरा पहला सवाल यह है कि क्या जो मुद्दे निपटाने है उनमें वह जहरीली गैस सम्मिलित है जिसे युद्ध में मानव संहार के लिये काम में लाया जाता है?

**श्री बसन्त साठे**: वह जहरीली गैस जिसने भोपाल में इतना बड़ा तहलका मचाया, वह अब वहां नहीं है और जो है वह क्लोरोफार्म 20 मीट्रिक टन है जिसे वहां से निकाला जा रहा है। दूसरा जो मटीरियल है जो खतरनाक नहीं बैन्जीन करके है, वह आरथो-डाइक्लोरोबेन्जीन लोकली वहां पर करीबन 70 मीट्रिक टन है। उसे भी वहा से हटाने का प्रबन्ध किया गया है।

**श्री प्यारेलाल खंडेलवाल**: क्या यह सच है कि यूनियन कारबाइड के शोध अनुसंधान संबंधी गैस की वैज्ञानिक जानकारी किसी वैज्ञानिक को न दी जाये, यह आदेश सरकार ने दिया है?

**श्री बसन्त साठे**: कृपया फिर से पूछिये?

श्री प्यारेलाल खंडेलवाल : क्या यह सच है कि यूनियन कार्बाइड के भोपाल अनुसंधान संबंधी गैस की वैज्ञानिक जानकारी किसी को न दी जाये ऐसे आदेश सरकार ने दिये हैं? (व्यवधान) किसी वैज्ञानिक या उन का सरकार को जो इसमें रुचि रखते हैं?

श्री वसन्त साठे : अभी हिदायत है कि उनकी जो पेरेन्ट कंपनीज थी उनका उसके साथ कोई संबंध न रहे, ऐसा कहा गया है और यहां भी जो उनकी सुविधा दी गई थी टैक्स के बारे में वह भी अभी हमने रिव्यू नहीं की है। बाकी कोई रिसर्च अपने यहां करता रहे तो उसे कैसे रोका जा सकता है, यह मुझे नहीं मालूम।

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Sir, there is a report in the newspaper—I am not sure about it, I want to get it confiirmed from the hon. Minister—that the R&D Union Carbide laboratory in Bhopal was engaged in resarch work for some material which can be used for chemical and bacteriological purposes. It is also reported that the gas emitted from the Bhopal plant contained cyanide. Is the Government aware that it is a poisonous gas? Thirdly, what is the present condition of the Vardharajan Inquiry Committee? Has the report been submitted to the Government and if so, when is it going to be laid before the Parliament?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, the Vardharajan Committee's report is not yet with us. As soon as we receive it, we will definitely look into it. But there was no confirmed report of cyanide to be there in this whole Bhopal affair. As far as the research relating to anything that is connected with their parent company is concerned, I have already replied that no permission has been given to them to have any contract for mutual research or any such information for any research in this unit with its parent company.

SHRI VITHALBHAI MOTIRAM PATEL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the chairman of the Union Carbide, Mr. Anderson, has threatened that if India will not compromise on the gas leakage and the death of the people in Bhopal, the American aid will be stopped and no assitance will come from America. What is the Government of India's reaction about it?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Government will not yield to any pressures from any quarters.

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS: I want to know from the hon. Minister whether it is a fact that near about 10,000 pregnant women are suffering from the after effects of some dangerous and poisonous chemicals. If so, what remedial steps the Government is taking in this regard?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, a large number of people—women and children—have suffered. This has been the biggest tragedy not only in this country but the whole world.

SHRIMATI MONIKA DAS: What the pregnant women?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, pregnant women also but I do not know the exact number. But all efforts are being made by the Government of Madhya Pradesh and Central Government to assist every suffering individual, particularly women.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, manufacturing of dangerous, poisonous chemicals is perhaps inevitable in any country which has an ambitious programme for industrialisation. But, Sir, I was reading an article the other day, unfortunately in developing countries only these accidents take place.

India, Madame . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are addressing the other person.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: was looking back, Sir; there was some whisper at the back. India, in that sense, is not such a backward country. We expect therefore that either the standards of safety which are prescribed are not adequate, if they are adequate then the monitoring of the supervision over the saftey measures is not adequate. beacause every time we hear this gas leakage here, that gas leakage there and the other day some Members of Parliament ware complaining the day, there was gas leakage here that

they were having sore throats etc. Therefore, I would like to know from the Minister whether or not—I do not know whether it is his Ministry that has to look into it, and if it is his Ministry that has to look into the safety matter—they are going to adopt further sophisticated methods and how they are going to monitor the implementation of the safety measures.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, the Government is keenly aware of the problem of chemical hazards and every precautionary measure, using all the latest technological facilities, will be taken to ensure that there is full safety for such hazards.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question. Question No. 284. Absent. Question No. 285. Absent. Question No. 286.

*284.. [*The questioner (Shri Parvathaneni Upendra) was absent. For answer, vide Col. 40 ...infra*]

*285. [*The questioners (Shri L. Ganesan and Shri V. Gopalsamy) were absent. For answer,* vide col. 40-41 infra].

**Production by paper mills**

*286. R. MOHD. HASHIM KIDWAI: Will the Minister of INDUSTRY be pleased to state:

(a) the number of paper mills set up both under the private and the public sectors, Statewise, till June, 1985; and

(b) the production of paper during the last two years in both the sectors of paper mills, Statewise?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF CHEMICALS AND PETRO CHEMICALS (SHRI R. K. JAICHANDRA SINGH): (a) A statement is laid on the Table of the House (*see below*).

(b) The total production of paper and paper-board during 1983, 1984 and 1985 (*upto June, 1985*) is as follows:—

(in lakh tonnes)

| | Central Public Sector | Others | Total |
|---|---|---|---|
| (1) 1983 . . . . . | 0·11 | 11·86 | 11·97 |
| (2) 1984 . . . . . | 0·09 | 13·62 | 13·71 |
| (3) 1985 (Jan-June) . . . . . | 0·05 | 7·08 | 7·13 |

**Statement**

*State-wise number of units for manufacture of paper and paper-board set up till June, 1985*

| Name of the State | Central Public Sector | Others | Total |
|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 1. Andhra Pradesh . . . . . | .. | 15 | 15 |
| 2. Assam . . . . . | .. | 2 | 2 |
| 3. Bihar . . . . . | .. | 6 | 6 |